Recipes for Resilience
Celebrating Palestinian cuisine and the ‘sumud’ of Palestinians living in the occupied territory of Hebron.

Fig. 1. Meeting with local street traders in Hebron.

By Melissa Stockdale, January 2015.

Supervisor: Dr Brigitte Piquard.

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the MA degree in Development and Emergency Practice,

Oxford Brookes University.

Centre for Development and Emergency Practice
Oxford Brookes University, Headington Campus, Oxford OX3 OBP UK.
Resilience to stand in the path of lightning.
Resilience to walk when darkness falls at noon.
Resilience to grind yourself fine in the turning mill.
Resilience will come to you.

Statement of Originality

This thesis is the result of my own independent work/investigation, except where otherwise stated. Other sources are acknowledged by explicit references.

Signed: M.J. Stockdale (candidate)  Date: 22nd January, 2015

I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for photocopying and for inter-library loan, and for the title and summary to be made available to outside organisations.

Signed: M.J. Stockdale (candidate)  Date: 22nd January, 2015

Statement of Ethics Review Approval

This dissertation involved human participants. A Form TDE E1 for each group of participants, showing ethics review approval, has been attached to this dissertation as an appendix.
Abstract

Some of the richest and most extensive anthropological studies on food have been focused on food insecurity, cuisine rituals, and identities. This research investigates not only the culture and the rituals, but also how the growing, buying, preparation, cooking, eating and sharing of food aids the development of human relationships, helps to celebrate personal identity, and effects emotional and social resilience. For those Palestinians living in the occupied territories in Hebron their whole existence is in daily jeopardy, and their hearts and minds are consumed with the restraints of occupation, and the frustration of the complex situation they find themselves in. Food is a necessity for survival, but it also is a reminder of cultural heritage and traditional values, and therefore, a catalyst for embracing family ties, historical connections, and social interaction; which in turn offers emotional support, and a sense of belonging in turbulent times of crisis. This study explores ways food may provide Palestinians in Hebron with brief interludes of relief from their predicament and help to build resilience.

Fig. 2. Early morning in Hebron.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cover page</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poem by Lal Ded in Shehadeh (2012:196)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of originality and ethics</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>4-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contents page</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of figures and photographs</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of acronyms</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A personal Note</td>
<td>9-11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>12-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>18-22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background, Rationale and literature review</td>
<td>23-26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research question, research aims and Methodology</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter outline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter One</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Context</td>
<td>28-32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Limitations</td>
<td>32-33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Recording of Information</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Effect of the research on participants</td>
<td>33-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Challenges</td>
<td>34-36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Two</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Cookbook</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The aim of the cookbook</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Collating the recipes</td>
<td>37-38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Designing the layout</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Three</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The participants</td>
<td>39-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Laila</td>
<td>40-41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Nibal</td>
<td>41-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Kahoud</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 The Confectioner</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 The Abrahamic Soup Kitchen</td>
<td>43-44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 The Juice Seller</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 The Kharoub Seller</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 The Jaberi Family</td>
<td>45-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10 A chance encounter with the owner of an abattoir</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11 Um Abdullah</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12 The Bread Bakers in the souk</td>
<td>47-48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13 Um Talal al Hadad</td>
<td>48-49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14 Abdi el Kareem Hadad</td>
<td>49-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15 The ‘Women in Hebron’ cooperative</td>
<td>50-52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Four</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions and Reflections</td>
<td>53-55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding poem by Darwish</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>56-62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>63-71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of figures and photographs

Unless stated, all the images are used with the kind permission of Tom Stockdale.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure Number</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Meeting with local street traders in Hebron.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Early morning in Hebron.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Ayatt Jaberi (the interpreter) with Tom Stockdale (the photographer). Photograph by Melissa Stockdale.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Laila (the host) with Melissa Stockdale (the researcher) in Hebron Old City.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Hebron Old City viewed from Tel Rumeida.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Photograph of Shuhada Street, Hebron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>A thriving vegetable market in Hebron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>The ‘Women of Hebron’ relaxed and content after cooking.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of acronyms

BSP – Building Sumud Project
CERAR – Centre for Study and Action Research on Resilience
HIRN – Hebron International Resources Centre
HRC – Hebron Rehabilitation Committee
ICRC – International Committee of the Red Cross
IDF – Israeli Defence Forces
IOF – Israeli Occupying Force
UNOCHA – United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
ODI – Overseas Development Institute
OPT – Occupied Palestinian Territory
PA – Palestinian Authority
UN – United Nations
UNWRA – United Nations Relief and Works Agency
A personal note

The idea for this research arose whilst on an Oxford Brookes University field trip in Palestine in April 2014. Whilst staying with a Palestinian family in Hebron Old City, I witnessed my host with her two daughters preparing food together everyday. Seeing them working together so effectively and symbiotically, observing their close bonds, jovial interaction, and emotional connectedness signified to me that this was a very special moment for them; a time of welcome relief, when they were able to forget their troubles briefly, and be able to celebrate family life and the cultural traditions that embrace their own identity. This moment of exception\(^1\) demonstrated the importance of how food can be a significant element in building sumud\(^2\) and inspired me to undertake research into the connection between food and resilience. Being passionate about everything to do with food, I decided that creating a cookbook as part of my Master’s programme centred around the stories of Palestinian families, would be a wonderful way of broadcasting to the world about the situation in Hebron, and at the same to time would celebrate the importance of Palestinian food culture in building sumud.

When writing the stories for this book, I have tried my utmost to relay the information that was freely and generously shared with me, as accurately and honestly as possible. I am aware that I may have unintentionally omitted certain facts, misquoted, used incorrect spellings, or not included certain details that participants would have wished me to include. No offence is intended, and I hope that any errors will be forgiven. The stories used were edited to reflect the general tone of resilience and hope, and written in a format to appeal to readers who may have limited knowledge of life in the occupied territories of the West Bank. By celebrating people’s relationship with food, it is hoped that readers will see how food can enrich lives, be a vital social and cultural factor to help Palestinians identify themselves, and additionally, endorse their remarkable existence and resilience in the face of adversity.

\(^1\)‘Moments of exception’ are exceptional moments in time when one is able to become so fully absorbed in a practical pastime that they are able for this brief period to forget the negative pressures and stresses that occupy their thoughts.

\(^2\)Sumud, an ineffable concept, is a difficult word to translate meaningfully into the English language, but it is generally accepted to mean ‘steadfastness in adversity’ (Malik, 2013).
Acknowledgements

Gathering the necessary research for this unconventional dissertation would not have been possible without the significant help of Ayatt Jaberi, who not only translated many long conversations from Arabic into English during the research trip, but also introduced some of the participants, and welcomed me with open arms into the bosom of her family home to meet the numerous members of her family who furnished me with many heart rendering stories, and ample amounts of delicious food and beverages.

Fig 3. Ayatt Jaberi (interpreter), with Tom Stockdale (photographer).

My son, Tom Stockdale, pictured above with Ayatt (Fig. 3), was incredibly supportive during the gathering of the data whilst in Palestine. He never complained about the very early morning starts, and extremely long days in the sweltering heat of the markets or the steamy kitchens. He managed to collect over four thousand photographic images,
and also dedicated long hours to editing these pictures on the return to England. Tom was respectful and sensitive to the culture and traditions of the families that we met. He provided the necessary reassurance to all the participants, who gladly gave permission for their photographs to be taken, and happily agreed for their images to be used in this dissertation and for publication in the resulting cookbook.

Laila’s contribution to this research was vital, not only did she generously provide accommodation for the whole period of time that we were in Palestine, but she also helped with travel arrangements, and translated conversations with local inhabitants and street vendors. Every morning, no matter how early, I was greeted with a huge smile, a warm hug, and a mug of delicious sweet mint tea. Her husband gave up his valuable time to drive us to other locations, and at the end of our stay, treated us to a special visit.
to the Dead Sea. All of Laila’s three daughters cooked meals everyday, and were incredibly patient and capable at translating the Arabic names of ingredients for the recipes, and preparing dishes suitably for the photographs. Huge appreciation goes to all the people in Hebron who kindly contributed to this research, and gladly gave up their time to cook delicious food, and share their stories.

My thanks to Nawal Sleimah for introducing me to women from the Hebronite community, and organising a cooking session, at the ‘Women in Hebron’ cooperative centre.

Hamed Qawasmeh, who works tirelessly for Hebron International Resource Network (HIRN), provided vital logistical advice, important local information, and in-country support during this research project. Thank you Hamed for generously giving up your time to assist with this study.

A special thank you to my fellow students, Rory Carnegie, Josh Ayers, Martin Dolan and Luiz Sergio Marques da Conceicao, for listening to my wild initial ideas for this research and for encouraging me to embark on this huge project. Also, Rachel Jones, Stephanie Helm Grovas, and Elaine Savage, my friendly and fun loving room mates who believed in the idea and shared their thoughts with me.

My heartfelt thanks to Brigitte Piquard, my inspiring lecturer, and dissertation supervisor, who introduced me to the concept of sumud, and the beauty of Palestine; your guidance and belief in my work, encouraged me to persevere during those blips that every writer encounters somewhere along the path towards final completion.

---

3 Women in Hebron is a Palestinian non-profit fair trade cooperative consisting of 120 women. The organization, established in 2005 by Nawal Sleimah, aims to provide women in the Hebron district with resources to help them support themselves and their families, through the production and sales of traditional Palestinian handicraft items. There is an outlet shop in the souk of Hebron Old City. (www.womeninhebron.com).

4 Hebron International Resource Network, HIRN, was established in 2011 as a joint Scandinavian and Hebron initiative to serve the most needy Palestinians living in and around Hebron. They also act as a resource centre for academics wishing to gain a deeper understanding of the conflict in the Middle East. (https://www.facebook.com/pages/HIRN/388180624554795).
Introduction

Research took place in the city of Hebron, a mountainous city with fertile land, which is located in the West Bank, thirty kilometres south of Jerusalem. It is one of the highest cities in the area being 950 metres above sea level (HRC, 2009). This Arab city has existed for over 4000 years and is a major reference in the study of Palestine’s social, cultural and religious history, and the evolution of Islamic civilisation. Hebron was named after the Prophet Ibrahim al-Khalil (Abraham the Friend), at the beginning of Islamic rule, and today, locals still call the city ‘Khalil al-Rahman’ meaning ‘friend of God’. Hebron Old City is referred to in the Bible and according to the Book of Genesis (25:9), the Prophet Abraham and his wife Sarah, including his children Isaac and Jacob are all buried in tombs within what the Muslims call the Ibrahimi Mosque. The mosque is also known as the Tomb of the Patriarchs, and is a major tourist attraction for all nationalities, being a sacred place to Muslims, Christians, and Jews (Platt, 2012).

![Fig. 5. Map showing the location of Hebron, in the West Bank, (Reliefweb, 2012).](image)
The Old City has a unique rich architectural heritage and is currently undergoing a mass restoration project lead by the Hebron Rehabilitation Committee,\(^5\) who are striving to re-establish livelihoods and revive the economy in Hebron. Many of Hebron’s inhabitants engage in agricultural activities connected to the food industry, especially grape vines and olive groves, and trade their food produce in the souk. Souk al-Qazzazin is the main market where trading takes place, and this area got its name from the renowned glassmaking profession (Abu Siriyya et al, 2009). There is an abundance of fresh fruit and vegetables for sale on stalls within the souk, as well as butchers shops, oil shops selling olive and sesame oil, bakers, confectioners, hardware stores, spice traders, coffee shops, and traders selling clothes, carpets and rugs and tourist items.

\[\text{Fig. 6. Hebron Old City viewed from Tel Rumeida.}\]

Some Palestinians living in the city, tend their own small orchards, growing grapes, figs, olives, plums, apples, cherries, apricots, and peaches to provide fresh produce for their families, and some Hebronites keep chickens, rabbits and dovecotes, on the flat roofs of their homes to provide further basic food supplies for their families.

\(^5\) Hebron Rehabilitation Committee (HRC) are trying to preserve the city’s architectural heritage and historical cultural fabric by also providing housing for residents, reviving the economy and trading, fighting poverty and unemployment, encouraging tourism and supporting people in their struggle against settlement and property confiscation (HRC, 2009).
Hebron is one of the largest cities in the West Bank and has an estimated population of 170,000 people made up of pre-Islamic Arab origins, Kurdish origins, Arab origins, Moroccan and Turkish origins, Jewish settlers and a host of refugees who fled to the city following the Nakba in 1948 (HRC, 2009).

In accordance with Oslo II Interim Agreement of September 1995, Palestinian areas in the West Bank were divided into three areas A, B, and C with the aim of a phased withdrawal of Israeli military force from each area. Hebron is situated in area B, where Palestinians have full civil control, but Israel continues to have overriding responsibility for security.

Area C, which encompasses Hebron, is controlled and administered by Israel, although Palestinians are responsible for economics, health and education. Palestinian farmers tending land in Area C require permits from the Israeli authorities to access their land and manage their crops, and the number of people who have permission to work the land is also limited, which dramatically affects food production and economic gain (ReliefWeb, 2012; Razek-Faoder and Dajani, 2013). Acquiring permits to continue farming is a long and stressful process, and requires huge effort, determination, and tenacity from the farmers (Shehadeh, 2008).

Israeli forces were redeployed in Hebron as part of the Hebron Protocol, which was signed in 1997 between Israel and the Palestinian Liberation Organisation. The city was divided into two areas, Hebron 1, known as H1, (governed by the Palestinian Authority), and Hebron 2, known as H2, (controlled by the Israeli military) (Fig. 7). Approximately 140,000 Palestinians live in the H1 area of Hebron and around 35,000 live in the H2 area amongst 500 Israeli settlers, and 1500 IDF soldiers (TIPH, 2014).

Inhabitants of Hebron Old City now live under a full apartheid style system with many of the roads being totally reserved for settlers. Palestinians are allowed to access some areas on foot, but not in their vehicles, and in other areas they can drive, but not walk.

---

6 Nakba is the Arabic word for ‘catastrophe’, and refers to the Palestinian Catastrophe of 1948, when the state of Israel was created and with the creation of UN Partition Plan over 700,000 Palestinians were expelled and became refugees (Tessler, 2009).
In some neighbourhoods, Palestinian residents can only gain access to their homes by traversing across the roofs of adjacent houses, and many have to pass through Israeli controlled checkpoints to travel to work (Abu Siriyya et al, 2009). There are currently 17 checkpoints to negotiate in the H2 area (BSP, 2014).

Trade, which has been one of the main revenue streams for Hebronites for years, has subsided recently due to political turmoil. In particular, the trading of food and connected goods, has continually declined as nearly two thousand shops, which were located in the H2 area have closed since the Second Intifada in 2000 (UNOCHA, 2007), hence, 77 per cent of the Palestinians living in Hebron Old City now live below the poverty line (ICRC, 2009).

Fig. 7. Map of Hebron showing the H1 and H2 areas (www.passia.org)
As Israel has total military control over the Old City and the outer parts of Hebron, Palestinians have to undergo complex, and often, undignified and humiliating security measures to enter and exit some areas. These restrictions have physical and emotional implications, and impede the livelihoods of inhabitants; therefore poverty is entrenched, and causes serious humanitarian concerns (UNOCHA, 2013).

**Fig. 8. Map of Hebron showing the movement restrictions** ([www.beiteshua.com, 2014](http://www.beiteshua.com))

Shuhada Street in H2 area (Fig 8), where locals used to buy and sell food, is just one of the commercial areas that is closed to Palestinians. The shops were welded shut by IDF soldiers in 1994 (BSP, 2014), and the street now resembles a ghost town rather than a thriving market community.
Palestinian protestors continue to actively demand that this area is reopened so that business can be restored (Deger, 2014). The photograph in Fig. 10 shows an existing thriving market street in another part of Hebron, where Palestinians are still able to trade, and this illustrates how Shuhada Street may have looked prior to the closure.

Despite the heavy military presence, and the daily physical, psychological and symbolic violence that takes place, which leads to an atmosphere of fear and insecurity, Palestinians continue to live in Hebron, and are determined to stay, resisting the pressure to leave. This patience, and ability to stay resilient, and remain strong is what they call sumud.
Background, rationale, and literature review

Food is an important part of Palestinian cultural heritage and national identity that needs to be celebrated and nourished. Qleibo (2009:1) believes that, ‘the Palestinian sense of identity, of belonging, of home, of warmth, security and joy, is inextricably bound up with food’. It also has religious connotations; ‘eating with other people’ is considered to be one of the recognised ways that Palestinians can increase their Barakah as well as obeying Allah and regularly reading the Qu’ran. Further information on the culture and traditions of Palestinian cuisine can be found in the supporting cookbook (Stockdale, 2015).

The origins of certain foods is debatable, and often contested, and it is recognised that food can sometimes be used as a political or diplomatic tool. Some authors including Fanon (1963) profess that occupiers are determined to devalue the rich culture and history of the people they control, and they attempt in various ways to jeopardise the hope of a future national culture and identity. Zaban (2007:1) suggests that ‘food carries with it a whole slew of beliefs, customs and cultural attributes that are liable to change the identity of diners as they eat’. He has observed how Israelis are colonizing Palestinian identity by adopting certain Palestinian dishes, like hummus, tahini and falafel as their own Israeli national symbols, thus ensuring Arab heritage is repressed and obliterated. There have been heated debates over the ownership of such foods and it is hard to prove the exact authentic history. It could be argued that celebrating traditional foods like hummus and falafel, may have the potential for aiding dialogue, and could therefore, be a useful tool in supporting conflict transformation.

An award winning short film and musical written by Ari Sandel and Kim Ray, called ‘West Bank Story – The Musical’ (Sandel and Ray, 2005) addresses the possibility of such conflict transformation with its humorous, fictional, portrayal of rivalry between an Israeli owner of a restaurant called ‘The Kosher King’ and a Palestinian owner of a restaurant called ‘The Hummus hut’. The short film depicts increasing tense conflict between the two sides. When the sister of the owner of the Hummus hut falls in love with an IDF soldier, they attempt to resolve the conflict between the Israelis and

---

7 Barakah an Arabic word translates to mean ‘blessing’.
Palestinians by jointly selling their food specialities to the public. The publication of this film demonstrates just one of the creative ways of opening dialogue.

Despite their different backgrounds, Yotam Ottolenghi, who was born in the Jewish Quarter of Jerusalem, and Sami Tamimi, who was born in the Muslim Quarter of Jerusalem collaborated to produce the cookbook entitled ‘Jerusalem’ to celebrate their love of food and what they call their ‘culinary DNA’ (Ottolenghi and Tamimi, 2012:9) and in this publication, they optimistically suggest that hummus could perhaps offer a route for bringing Jerusalemites together.

Chapple-Sokol (2013) an independent researcher, and consultant on culinary diplomacy believes in actively promoting food as a tool of diplomacy, and he suggests that food could be used as an instrument of social conflict resolution. He has observed that ‘the act of eating together, or commensality, can set the table for potentially healing conversations’, (Chapple-Sokol, 2014:1). However, he recognises that it is not just eating food together, but also the thinking about it, preparing it, and serving it together, that truly provides opportunities for improving interactions and cooperation. This view endorses Gordon Allport’s ideas of how cooperative striving towards a shared goal can bring about solidarity. He suggests that ‘only the type of contact that leads people to do things together is likely to result in changed attitudes’ (Allport, 1954:276).

Rawia Bishara the author of ‘Olives, Lemons & Za’atar’ (Bishara 2014) was inspired by her Palestinian roots to write a cookbook to include a range of Middle Eastern cuisine that celebrates traditional cooking, but she also includes contemporary recipes that celebrate the changes in accessibility to certain foods. She describes how the Arabic culture of offering an abundance of food to guests, and the partaking of meals together, provides opportunities for debates and the sharing of stories, opinions and experiences.

Laila El-Haddad and Maggie Schmitt the co-authors of ‘The Gaza Kitchen’ (El-Haddad and Schmitt, 2012) highlight how food is one of the most significant ways of declaring a unique identity, and how it is an expression of history, culture and heritage. Through food they illustrate the spirit and resilience of the people of Gaza, whilst also addressing the ethnographic and political connotations. They remain unconvinced that food alone could reverse years of human rights abuses; indeed, El-Haddad recently tweeted, ‘we
categorically reject the notion of *hummus kumbaya*\(^8\) – breaking bread can never foster coexistence [sic] if inequalities go unaddressed’ (El-Haddad, 2013). Despite these strong views, there is no doubt that food can be one of the quickest ways of instigating conversation, and therefore at a grass roots level, it could be used to bring people together to open their minds, and begin to foster the first steps of mutual understanding.

Ghandour (2010:76) discusses the idea of Palestine being a ‘lost paradise’ and explores how Palestinians consider food as an essential part of their history, existence and wellbeing. She says, ‘food (its cultivation, preparation, consumption, food as celebration) was one of the recurring themes evocatively brought up by these teary-eyed regretful old people’. There is no doubt that in Palestine, cooking is very much a form of cultural expression, (Albala, 2011; Heine, 2004; Baramki, 2007; Bsasu, 2005 and Shihab, 1993), and Mintz and Du Bois (2002) refer to this in their anthropology of food and eating. Bahloul (1989) recognises and highlights the aspect of the rituals surrounding food, as powerful forces for reinforcing ethnicity and these historic practices are often used to celebrate the memory of who and what we are.

Mahmoud Darwish, a famous National poet (Darwish, 2010) also embraced the idea of how food can reinforce National identity. He was considered to be a skilled and proficient cook, and in one of his many interviews he meticulously described the effort of selecting the best meat, and the importance of using the correct quality and quantity of spices, salt and garlic. Darwish considered Mansaf an ancient Palestinian dish to be his preferred choice of food, ([www.darwish.org](http://www.darwish.org), 2014). He talked passionately about his way of preparing *Qahwa Sada*\(^9\), the special, traditional Palestinian bitter coffee with cardamom.

A recently published cookbook entitled ‘Share’ (Oakervee, 2013) is a collection of recipes representing the plight of women living in areas of conflict, and their exposure to unpredictable circumstances in various countries throughout the world. This book highlights the situation for such women, but also embraces their wellbeing, and to this

---

\(^8\) *Hummus Kumbaya* is a metaphor for the Israeli – Palestinian conflict and refers to how the shared love of hummus may be enough to resolve the situation. Another expression journalists have been known to use is ‘peace on a plate’.

\(^9\) *Qahwa Sada* is a bitter cardamom coffee that is served with dates and special sweets at funerals, weddings, holidays, and during religious ceremonies.
aim, inspiring stories of some of these women are recounted throughout the book. This publication confirms how food can be a caveat for highlighting concerns, and expressing culture.

El-Haddad and Schmitt (2012) and Oakervee (2013) in their cookbooks both hint at the concept of resilience in relation to people living in areas of conflict, but what exactly is meant by resilience? Carlson et al (2012:vii) define resilience as ‘the ability of an entity to anticipate, resist, absorb, respond to, adapt to and recover from a disturbance’. Wagnild (2009:1) suggests ‘resilient people respond to life’s challenges with courage and emotional stamina, even when they are afraid’. Considering this statement, it seems important to investigate how food may be a possible factor that supports or encourages the development of such resilience. Hylland Eriksen (2001) relates resilience to cultural heritage, and points out that although culture is a dynamic and changing concept, it is what makes communication possible, and the habits and experiences that human beings share, aid mutual understanding.

The concept of resilience was initially considered in relation to children, and prominent researchers in this field, including Rutter (1999), Ungar (2004), Resnick et al (2004), and Luthar (2006) investigated the protective factors, and the social construction of resilience. Wagnild and Young (1993) have carried out extensive research that has emphasised the importance of resilience to protect against, and reverse negative emotions like depression, anxiety, fear and helplessness. Such feelings and mental illnesses, is often experienced by those living in unpredictable, and dangerous environments, similar to the situation in Hebron.

Resilience is recognised as a dynamic process that involves personal negotiation (Tusaie and Dyer, 2004). As part of Wagnild and Young’s (1993) studies, they developed a resilience scale to measure the strength of an individual’s resilience. Each person’s resilience core is made up of five essential characteristics: The most important element being a meaningful life or having a purpose in life, followed by perseverance, self-reliance, equanimity, a existential aloneness and the ability to feel at home, or being ‘comfortable in your own skin’.
Previous research has unveiled certain factors that promote individuals resilience, and the concepts such as hardiness, sustainability, learned resourcefulness, self-efficacy\(^{10}\), a sense of coherence, stamina, and locus of control, are common indicators that are used to identify resilience (Garmezy, 1993; Glantz and Slobada, 1999; Luthar and Cicchetti 2000; Luthar et al, 2000, Ryff et al, 1998 and Rotter, 1954).

Although academic studies on food are common, less research seems to have been undertaken on how food may be a crucial social resilience factor for people living within occupied territories, and to the best of the researcher’s knowledge no studies have been published on how food may affect the sumud and self-efficacy of Palestinians living in Hebron (Malik, 2013).

\(^{10}\) *Self-efficacy* is defined as a person’s subjective appraisal of his or her ability to cope with the environmental demands of the stressful situation (Bandura, 1995, 1997) and has been correlated with better psychological adjustment following severe environmental stressors and military combat (American Psychiatric Association, 1987).
Research question

How does food support the building of sumud and self-efficacy for Palestinians living in the occupied territory of Hebron?

Research aims

To gather data on how the growing, buying, preparing, cooking, sharing and eating of food impacts on the emotional and social behaviours of inhabitants of Hebron, who are exposed to the extreme daily stresses of living within the occupied area of Palestine; and to begin to evaluate how food, its culture, and traditions, effects sumud and resilience.

Methodology

This primary qualitative field research (Walliman, 2006; Bryman, 2012) was carried out whilst being totally immersed in the everyday lives of a selected group of Palestinian families, and interviewing business owners, and volunteers living in the occupied territories of Hebron (Fig. 11).

Fig. 11. Map of Hebron showing restrictions to Palestinian residents (www.btselem.org, 2014).
Using a participant observation method (Denscombe, 2003) provided opportunities for first hand experience. Being able to listen to people’s stories whilst being closely involved, allowed for detailed observation, and therefore, a fuller understanding of the event being studied. Prior to collecting data, participants were given information about the aims of the research, and they were also informed about how their participation would contribute to the process. Further clarity was given when required or requested. In line with ethical procedures, it was made clear that they could opt out of the research at any time, for any reason. Throughout the time spent with each person, permission was regularly sought to continue, and even when prior permission had been given to take notes and photographs, participants were given further opportunities to respond, and they were also shown the photographs that had been taken in their homes and businesses to make sure that the images that had been captured were acceptable to use. (See example of a consent form in appendix 1).

This study was based on the ‘five features of qualitative research’ (Yin, 2011:8),

1. Studying the meaning of people’s lives in real world conditions.
2. Representing the views and perspectives of the people in the study.
3. Covering the contextual conditions within which people live.
4. Contributing insights into existing and emerging concepts that may help to explain social behavior.
5. Striving to use multiple sources of evidence rather than relying on a single source alone.

Data was collected by note taking, and the use of photographic images, whilst following the daily activities of the participants as they shopped, cooked and ate food. Information was gathered whilst sitting and talking, and sharing the experience of the cooking process and dining with their families. Notes and photographs were taken after seeking permission, and a Palestinian interpreter was used on most occasions to translate conversations, written documentation, and recipes. Some participants chose not to use their real names, so some names were omitted or false names were used. All agreed that their stories could be published.
Due to the explorative, fluid and flexible nature of this qualitative research people were encouraged to freely share their thoughts and feelings as they carried on with their daily activities. It was important for the researcher to not only listen and keep detailed notes on the narrative, but to also ask open questions to encourage sharing of information about each individual family history, past, present and future ideas, social circles, views on traditions and different cultural ideas, and how they perceived they own abilities. During this process, information was also noted on how each of the participants interacted and connected with others, including non-verbal gestures, facial expressions and physical mannerisms.

The resilience scale (Wagnild, 2009) was used to help identify the factors that determine how meaningful food is to participants, and in what way it can support their self-reliance, perseverance, humour, and positive outlook for the future. Some ideas for the methodology were adapted from methods that were successfully used in prior research on resilience, which was carried out in the South Hebron Hills, Palestine in April 2014 (Ayers et al, 2014), with the aid of Oxford Brookes University, the Building Sumud Project (BSP), the Centre for Study and Action Research on Resilience (CERAR) and the Hebron International Resources Centre (HIRN).

The following indicators were used to help understand the meaning of people’s lives in real world conditions and to gain insights into concepts that help explain social behaviour (Yin, 2011).

The six main areas being:

1. **Common aspirations**: for example, the desire to stay strong, to celebrate each day of life, to achieve new things, to keep the family or community together, and remain positive.

2. **Social Capital**: including, offering physical and emotional support to each other, attachment to others, listening and sharing ideas, networking, and communication. The basic idea of social capital is that family, friends and associates constitute an important asset that can be accessed in a crisis (Woolcock and Narayan, 2000, Woolcock, 2001).

3. **Physical status and mannerisms**: including physical health and wellbeing, connectedness, body language, touching and close physical contact, laughter, smiles and grimaces.
4. **Moments of exception**: the creation of significant moments, events and positive memories, and the ability to be able to ‘enjoy the moment’. Csikszentmihalyi (1975) identified six factors that can instigate moments of exception or *flow*[^11] as he describes it. 1) Intense and focused concentration on the present moment; 2) Merging of action and awareness; 3) A loss of reflective self-consciousness; 4) A sense of personal control or agency over the situation or activity; 5) A distortion of temporal experience; 6) Experience of the activity as intrinsically rewarding, also referred to as *autotelic*[^12] experience.

5. **Locus of control**: Rotter’s (1954, 1975) ‘Locus of Control Scale’ was not relevant to use in its entirety for this research, but his ideas were explored to determine whether participants tended towards an ‘internal locus of control’ or ‘external locus of control’. In other words, were the people realistic in their outlook? Did they take responsibility for their own actions? Were they in control of their own destiny? Or alternatively, were they fatalistic, blaming others for their misfortunes and feeling negative or out of control?

6. **Self-efficacy**: Perceived self-efficacy plays a key role in how people function. Efficacy beliefs will influence how a person ‘perseveres in the face of obstacles, their resilience to adversity, the quality of their emotional life and how much stress and depression they experience in coping with taxing environment demand’ (Bandura, 2006:309); so this is a particularly pertinent element to consider in this research. The ideas of Bandura (1997, 2006, 2010) were used to identify the participant’s core belief in their ability to influence events that affect their lives to help measure their perseverance and self-efficacy. Those people with a strong sense of self-efficacy recover quickly from set backs, whereas those with a weak self-efficacy tend to avoid situations, fail to overcome problems, lose control and lack direction.

[^11]: *Flow* is an *autotelic experience* and a ‘holistic sensation that people feel when they are totally involved’ (Csikszentmihalyi, 1975:36).

[^12]: *Autotelic* comes from the Greek word ‘*auto*’ meaning ‘self’ and the word ‘*telos*’ meaning goal or purpose. An *autotelic activity* would be one that requires ‘formal and extensive energy on the part of the actor yet provided few if any conventional rewards’ (Csikszentmihalyi, 1975:10).
Chapter outline

This unconventional dissertation is made up of a cookbook that is yet to be published (Stockdale, 2015), and this academic paper, which is divided into four chapters.

Chapter One describes the context, and explains the limitations and challenges that were encountered whilst collecting data and conducting this qualitative field research.

Chapter two explains how evidence from this research, including photographs, were edited and adapted to create and illustrate a cookery book.

Chapter three assesses the evidence collected from the participants, living and working in Hebron Old City, including home environments, market stalls, private businesses, volunteers who work at the Abrahamic Soup Kitchen, families living in the midst of Tel Rumeida settlement, and the Kiryat Arba settlement; and a group of nine women, who are part of the ‘Women in Hebron’ cooperative.

Chapter four addresses the research question, offering conclusions and reflections on the research that was conducted.
Chapter One

1.1 Context

The State of Israel, was founded by Jews migrating from Europe who began to colonize Palestine in the 19\textsuperscript{th} century (RW, 2004). In 1918, there were 680,000 Palestinians and 56,000 Jews living in Palestine. Palestinians owned 97\% of the land. In 1922, British imperialists encouraged more Jewish immigrants to settle in Israel (Said and Hitchens, 1988) and since this time Palestinians have felt persecuted. Today, settlers use the 1929 massacre\textsuperscript{13} to justify the forced eviction of Palestinian Hebron residents (Greenwald, 2009).

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure12.png}
\caption{Map showing the loss of Palestinian land, (Olson, 2009).}
\end{figure}

After the UN Partition plan in 1947, and the departure of the British in 1948, Israel declared its independence and began systematically destroying Palestinian society (Tessler, 2009). After the Six Day War in 1967, or ‘Harb\textsuperscript{14} 1967’ as it is called in

\textsuperscript{13} The Hebron Massacre occurred on August 23, 1929, when a frenzied mob of Arabs armed with axes, knives and iron bars broke into Jewish homes and slaughtered 69 Jews (Greenwald, 2009).

\textsuperscript{14} Harb means ‘war’ in Arabic.
Palestine, Israel confiscated further territories in the West Bank (Razek-Faoder and Dajani, 2013).

From 1987 to 1992 the Palestinians rose up against the occupation and this was known as the First Intifada. Following the Cave of the Patriarchs Massacre in 1994, and despite the fact that Palestinians were the victims, the Israeli government launched curfews on the people living in Hebron and proceeded to close the Ibrahimi Mosque for ten months.

When the mosque was reopened, separate entrances were created, and clearly defined areas were then allocated for Muslims and Jews. In addition to the closures and curfews imposed on the Palestinians, Israeli soldiers were brought into the city of Hebron supposedly to protect the small settler community that was slowly growing. Hence, as previously mentioned, many of the roads in and around Hebron are now reserved just for use of the Jewish settlers, and Palestinians are forbidden to use them.

Israel’s current government policy impacts thousands of Palestinians by violating their human right to life, liberty and personal safety, freedom of movement, education and health (The Electronic Intifada, 2007; IRIN News, 2007). The imposed restrictions of movement have severe humanitarian impacts. In addition to hindering economic growth in Hebron, the unpredictable long curfews and restrictions place immense psychological pressure on the families who are prevented from pursuing their livelihoods, attending school, or being able to access health services (Mataria et al, 2007; OCHA, 2008). It is also aggravating for the Palestinian inhabitants to know that the settler population has never been placed under curfew. A report by the ODI on the Hebron situation stated that ‘elaborate longstanding and multifaceted bureaucracy of restriction and control of movement and access to land and property fundamentally affects livelihoods,’ (Jaspars and O’Callaghan, 2010:7).

---

15 The First Intifada, started in 1987 when the Palestinians showed resistance against Israeli occupation.
16 The Cave of the Patriarchs Massacre took place in 1994 when an American born Israeli settler gunned down 30 Palestinian Muslims during prayer in the Abraham Mosque (Smith, 2014).
The Palestinian people launched a Second Intifada in September 2000\(^{17}\) to show resistance against Israeli domination, which lasted until early 2005. Since this time, there has been regular local clashes, and civil unrest as the Israeli government continues to absorb Palestinian territory, and impose increasing restrictions on Palestinians.

This ongoing conflict is obviously multifaceted, and extremely complex, and it continues to be one of the world’s most problematic international issues. The book, ‘The Plight of the Palestinians; A Long History of Destruction’ (Cook, 2010), provides views of the victimisation of the Palestinians, and the methodical genocide taking place in Palestine. Baroud (2010) commends this publication on its documentation of the ‘logical evolution from suffering to resistance’. Edward Platt’s book ‘The City of Abraham: History, Myth and Memory: A Journey through Hebron’ (Platt, 2012), recounts stories of some of the residents and settlers in Hebron, and discusses the roots of the struggle to control the land from both perspectives.

As Palestinians families have become separated, and their historic lands have become increasingly inaccessible, they have also found it harder to gain access to the traditional ingredients required for authentic cooking purposes. Many of the wild plants, and herbs that are commonly used, in Arab cuisine are now designated by the Israeli government as protected, and Palestinians are prohibited from picking them. For example, the best \textit{za’atar}\(^{18}\) grows on the hills in areas of the West Bank where Palestinians are denied access. El-Haddad and Schmitt (2012:76) reveal that ‘in 1977 Israeli Law declared \textit{za’atar} a protected species, claiming that the fast growing perennial was on the verge of extinction. This law was extended to the West Bank by military order in 2007 where these plants have been confiscated by Israeli forces at checkpoints. Foragers are subject to hefty fines’.

This plant along with other ancient and traditional herbs is now one of the ‘forbidden fruits’ under Israeli law, and many Palestinians believe that the introduction of these

---

\(^{17}\) The Second Intifada, also known as the Al-Aqsa Intifada, started in September 2000 and was the second uprising against Israeli occupation and lasted until early 2005 (www.aljazeera.com).

\(^{18}\) \textit{Za’atar} is the large leaf wild thyme that is commonly used in many Palestinian dishes. It is from the oregano family with a distinctive taste more pungent than regular oregano.
restrictive laws is a form of ‘symbolic violence’\textsuperscript{19} and a way of persecuting Arab culture (Vered, 2008). Studies by Ali-Shtayeh et al., (2008) show that the traditional habit of foraging for edible herbs is sadly declining due to difficulties of access to certain areas. Indeed, Reuters (2014) reported in March 2014 that a Palestinian teenager was shot dead by Israeli troops for foraging for wild thistles for cooking.

Palestine is considered to be the birthplace of the Olive Tree (El-Haddad and Schmitt, 2012) with some trees in the area dating back to 4000 years, (ReliefWeb, 2012). Many families living in and around Hebron tend olive groves that have been passed down to them for generations, and the harvest season in October is a special celebratory time, which has deep socio-cultural meaning, when families get together to remember their forefathers, and enjoy feasts with traditional recipes incorporating olives and olive oil. Most of the olive production is for local consumption, and is mainly converted into olive oil, with the remainder of the crop being used for table olives, pickles and for making olive oil soap.

In and around Hebron there has been deliberate destruction of olive trees by Israeli settlers as a further form of symbolic violence. UNOCHA (2012) reported that 7,500 olive trees were destroyed between January and mid October 2012 alone, and over 2.5 million trees, one third of which are olive trees have supposedly been uprooted since 1967, (ReliefWeb, 2012). As Shehadeh (2010:91) describes, ‘the olive growers go to pick their olives and are attacked by settlers. They have no one to call upon: the Israeli police stand on the side watching and doing nothing, the Palestinian police are prohibited from interfering’. The crops from ancient olive trees provide many farmers with their main source of income, but they are also symbolic of Palestinians’ attachment to their land. Despite the poor soil conditions, the trees continue to thrive, and this growth symbolically represents the Palestinian resilience and resistance.

\textsuperscript{19} Symbolic violence refers to actions that have a discriminatory or injurious meaning or implication. The concept of ‘symbolic violence’ introduced by a French Sociologist, called Pierre Bourdieu, refers to the tacit, almost unconscious mode of cultural and social domination (Bourdieu and Wacquant, 2004).
According to ‘Human Needs Theory’ (Burton, 1990) conflicts are caused by basic universal human needs not being met, which would apply to the situation in Hebron. In January 2007, a UN special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in the occupied territory of Palestine confirmed that, ‘undoubtedly the most aggravated settler behaviour occurs in Hebron, where Palestinian school children are assaulted and humiliated on their way to schools, shopkeepers are beaten and residents live in fear of settler terror’ (OCHA, 2008:15).

The Building Sumud Project (BSP, 2014) an action driven research initiative, focuses on the impact of the occupation upon Palestinian residents in Hebron Old City, and the inhabitants of the South Hebron Hills. BSP’s recent research on Hebronites living in the Old City highlights the daily systematic direct and indirect forms of hardship that Palestinians there are exposed to, and recognises that to exist in such circumstances requires high levels of resistance, resilience and sumud. BSP’s approach is to try and support and strengthen the existing sumud in Hebron, by helping to create an environment of emotional and social stability, so that local groups and individuals are encouraged to develop innovative strategies to increase their sumud. In the context of this struggle to survive despite relentless oppression and restrictions, this study explores the relationship between food and sumud for Palestinian men, women and their families living in the occupied areas in and around Hebron.

1.2 Limitations

Due to personal time restrictions, and cost constraints, it was only possible to allow two weeks for collecting data from participants in Hebron. It would have validated this research further, by including more participants, and being able to spend a longer duration for research in the region. It was decided that with the little time allocated, it was more beneficial to spend longer periods of time with less participants, rather than including more people and only having brief periods of time with each. This decision definitely proved correct, as some of the most useful information was gathered once the participants had spent many hours getting to know the researcher. Spending more time together developed a deeper trust and understanding of the process, and the people became more familiar with the researcher’s presence, and intentions. Conversation
flowed more fluently when the participants were more relaxed, and it was noted that this often happened after meals had been consumed together.

1.3 Recording of information

Different coloured journals were used for keeping notes about each of the interviewees. To ensure as much information as possible was recorded, abbreviations were used, and codes for certain responses. This information was then transcribed each evening on to the computer and placed in hidden files. The photographic images were downloaded at the end of each day, then dated, and assigned a specific code to correspond to the information that had been recorded.

It was impossible to record every conversation in full, particularly when listening to large groups of people all talking over each other in the Arabic tongue. The translator was sometimes only able to convey the general meaning of the narrative, or interpret the most significant parts of the discussion.

1.4 Effects of the research on participants

Overall, participants showed an eagerness to participate, and gratitude towards being selected for inclusion in this study. No one was reluctant to take part in the research. They seemed delighted to have a person from Europe showing an interest in their life, and they were proud and keen to share their beliefs, experiences, and skills for the benefit of the research project.

Goodhand (2000:1) warns that researchers ‘need to be aware of how their interventions may affect the incentive systems and structures driving violent conflict or impact upon the coping strategies and safety of communities’. Safety and security was paramount whilst conducting this research, and although normally the presence of an international visiting Palestinians living within the occupied territories is not normally considered detrimental to the safety of communities, it was disheartening, and of great concern to discover that many of the families who participated in the research process

---

20 For the purposes of this research paper an international is a person who is visiting Palestine who lives permanently outside of the Middle East.
became victims of brutal attacks and demolition orders by the IDF\textsuperscript{21} less than six weeks after the research visit. It is hoped that this was just coincidental, and that the presence of an international researcher spending time within their homes did not act as an incentive, or encourage the IDF to take such violent actions against them.

According to news reports (BBC News, 2014b), the increased force of the IDF against these communities may have been initiated following the kidnapping, and unlawful killing of three Israeli teenagers, Naftal Frenkel, Gilad Shaar, and Eyal Yifrach within these territories, in June, 2104, (BBC News, 2014a); and the situation declined further amid the tensions following the brutal murder, (and possible revenge killing) of Abu Khdair, a Palestinian teenager (BBC News, 2014c).

The violence escalated into a bloody war between Israel and Hamas, with major attacks occurring in Gaza causing many deaths and injuries, and a resulting displacement of over 1.8 million Palestinians. According to UNRWA (2014), this two-month conflict saw the destruction of 20,000 homes with at least 2,131 Palestinians, 64 Israeli soldiers and 6 civilians losing their lives. Thankfully, a ceasefire that was agreed on 26th August 2014 has been maintained, and peace talks are now taking place, although the Palestinian News Network (PNN, 2014) report that there is continued unrest in the West Bank area, with the IOF\textsuperscript{22} conducting raids and arrests of young men from homes in Hebron.

Although being fully aware of ‘do no harm’ (Anderson, 1999), it is sometimes impossible to measure, or predict outcomes, or conceive of situations where harm may occur, particularly in such volatile and fragile environments.

1.5 Challenges

Not being able to speak Arabic did present a challenge, and although interpreters were used, some were more adept than others at translating and relaying the correct interpretation of the narrative shared. One meeting with a participant had to be aborted when it became clear that the interpreter was biased, and not experienced enough in

\textsuperscript{21} IDF – stands for Israeli Defense Forces, a part of the Israeli Army.

\textsuperscript{22} IOF – stands for Israeli Occupying Force.
translating to provide enough time for the participant to understand, or be able to respond appropriately to the questions asked.

It was also recognised that vital information and correct meanings may have been missed, as it was impossible to record every word that each person contributed to the conversations, particularly when working with larger families and groups.

Recording conversations on a machine was not always viable, so abbreviated notes were taken during the long hours spent with the families. The most crucial information gathered, was then reflected back to the participants to ensure that the facts, dates and meanings were being correctly interpreted. This did take additional time, but proved invaluable both for the participants and the researcher. Often dates, times and crucial information that was recorded had been misunderstood or translated incorrectly in the heat of the moment!

Soon after meeting one of the participants it was obvious that the stories she shared, had been told many times to previous researchers, and therefore may have been elaborated, so it was decided not to include these ‘practised’, or biased stories in this research paper.

As reported by Norman (2009) gaining access and working in conflict zones does present some challenges. Whilst going through military check points and working in more sensitive areas, Israeli soldiers did sometimes question intentions for wishing to proceed to certain occupied territory. Any potential problems were successfully avoided by always smiling, giving polite and brief replies, and by taking on the role of an interested tourist.

Moving in and around Hebron often required support from local inhabitants who were keen to forge new friendships. To protect the family that were hosting the visit, it was important to remain vigilant, and careful about what information was shared with such relative strangers. Discretion was a vital element. Sensitive information and data from the research was recorded in a series of notebooks, and this information had to carefully modified, and transcribed into various documents on the computer before crossing the border back into Israel. This was a very time consuming exercise, but a vital precaution for the safety and protection of those people in Palestine who had provided information
for this research. Thankfully, although being stopped and questioned for several hours at the border controls, and having luggage searched thoroughly, the research was not compromised.

Debriefing at the end of each full day was essential, but despite processing information on a regular basis, it was apparent that there had not been enough mental preparedness for the significant emotional effect that experiences of such research would have. The stories that were shared were very powerful, and certain facts, or parts of conversations often lingered and dominated one's thoughts. Also, it was underestimated how emotionally overwhelming it would be to live with a Palestinian family in a conflict zone amidst such uncertainty, sharing the ups and downs of family life. It was surprising how quickly close bonds and attachments were formed. Leaving the host family at the end of the research process ignited intense emotional feelings.
Chapter Two

2.1 The aim of the cookbook

In his research, William Cotter (2012) has explored the concept of sumud and investigated how literature can be used as an avenue for highlighting and promoting Palestinian resistance. He acknowledges the various ways that Palestinians have advocated for change through nonviolent acts such as the publication of literature, and it seems fitting that this cookbook publication could be another tool for advocacy to encourage reflection amongst the wider international community.

In line with BSP’s commitment to translate research into empowering strategies, new creative projects, and artistic initiatives, it is hoped that the published cookbook (Stockdale, 2015) will act as an awareness raising campaign to highlight and to celebrate the existing sumud of Palestinians living in Hebron, and will also initiate and encourage others to seek innovative, and artistic ways of exploring resilience, and supporting the building of sumud. For marketing reasons, the book is entitled “SUMUD FOOD” and in smaller print on the front cover, are the words, “Palestinian Cuisine – Recipes for Resilience”.

2.2 Collating the recipes

Transcribing the lists of ingredients, and writing the recipes correctly in a format that is easy to follow was an unexpected lengthy process. Recreating the recipes again to make sure that all the correct measures of ingredients used were exact, was time consuming, but a more enjoyable stage of the work. The testing of each dish, highlighted discrepancies, for example, which ingredients were difficult to source outside of Palestine. This information enabled substitutes to be suggested and to be included in the cookbook.

Each of the participants recommended an authentic traditional recipe that had a special meaning for them, and it was decided to link these contributions alongside their photographs and respective stories within the publication. To create a more structured cookbook that would appeal to the general public, the content was divided into
organised sections for hummus and dips, bread, soups, meat dishes, vegetable dishes, desserts and drinks. Wherever possible, the Arabic names of the food and recipes were used. As is normal practice in cookbooks, an index to the recipes, and a conversion table for weights and measures was also included.

2.3 Designing the layout

A flat plan (appendix 1) was used to organise and plan the draft layout of pictures, information and recipes. It was decided that text should be limited to a minimum and to focus on the photographs of people, and their stories alongside simple recipes. Much time was spent on choosing fonts, and suitable photographs to illustrate the book. Editing of the stories to fit the limited space on the pages was extremely time consuming. The ‘In Design’ programme (www.adobe.com/Indesign) provided the parameters for creating the design of the book. Learning to use this software programme competently was challenging.
Chapter Three

3.1 The participants

All the participants who took part were Palestinians living or working in and around Hebron, and they were selected for their connections with food. Multiple sources of evidence were collected from men and women of different ages within Hebron Old City, and participants living in Tel Rumeida Settlement, and Kiryat Arba Settlement, (Fig. 13), were chosen as they are living in particularly repressed areas very close to Jewish settlements that are renowned for extreme settler violence.

Fig. 13. Map showing the location of Hebron Old City, Tel Rumeida, and Kiryat Arba settlement. (Btselem, 2014).

For triangulation purposes data was collected from street traders, and other small business owners in the food industry within Hebron, including a hummus maker, a baker, a confectioner, and a juice maker. Information from a chance encounter with an owner of an abattoir in Hebron was also included. In addition, evidence was gathered from observing and photographing volunteers working at ‘The Abrahamic Soup
close to the Ibrahimi mosque whilst they were preparing and cooking the donated food to give out to the poorest men, women and children living in the Hebron Old City. A group of nine women from the ‘Women in Hebron’ cooperative were also observed cooking together.

For the purposes of creating the cookbook it was important to choose people who were keen to participate, and willing to cook their chosen food, whilst being photographed. It was important to gather a range of traditional recipes, for a variety of Palestinian cuisine including soups, bread, dips and hummus, meat, vegetable dishes, and sweet desserts. Each participant supplied an authentic recipe for a Palestinian dish that they personally enjoyed, and that they were able to create themselves. They prepared their chosen dishes whilst sharing their stories.

The participant’s stories and original recipes are all included in the cookbook (Stockdale, 2015), whereas, the findings of the research with regard to how food may support the building of sumud and self-efficacy is outlined below for each individual participant involved.

### 3.2 Laila

Laila, (52) a formidable lady, successfully manages three shops in the souk for ‘Women in Hebron’ selling carpets, clothes, locally made handicrafts, and jewellery to raise money for the women’s cooperative in order to support women in desperate need who are living in occupied territory in and around Hebron. Most of the money she earns is used to buy the freshest locally produced food for feeding her family.

Despite the many setbacks that Laila has encountered in her life, and the on-going stresses of coping with her own health issues, whilst also caring for her children, the wellbeing of her husband, and managing the costs of supporting her two sons who are

---

23 The Abrahamic Soup Kitchen now situated in a side street between the HRC offices, and Ibrahimi Mosque serves food every day for the benefit of the poor. It was supposedly established in the latter half of the tenth century and was described as an inn ‘open to strangers, which boasts a cook, a baker and servants, who serve a meal of lentils with olive oil to the poor and to pilgrims, and even to the rich should they want it’ (Platt, 2012:88).
currently in different prisons in Haifa and Jaffa, she still maintains an ‘internal locus of control’ (Rotter, 1975).

Laila continues to persevere in the face of adversity, which demonstrates a strong sense of self-efficacy. She takes responsibility for her own actions and has a certain control over her own destiny by working everyday in the souk, providing meals, offering shelter to international visitors, and giving guided tours of Hebron Old City. Her extended family offer her emotional support, and she has high social capital with a wealth of friends and associates who she can turn to in event of a crisis.

Preparing meals each day provides ample opportunities for social interaction with her family and international visitors, and this strengthens her sumud. Many significant moments were observed when Laila demonstrated intense and focused concentration whilst engaged in ‘autotelic activities’ (Csikszentmihalyi, 1975) in the process of cooking. Conversations with Laila revealed a positive determination to stay strong and work hard to earn enough money to provide for her family. She celebrates every day of her life, and is optimistic about the future. The stories she shared, gave direct links to specific foods that triggered memorable historical events in her life, illustrating how food can provide strong links to the past, and endorse her cultural heritage.

3.3 Nibal

Nibal (24) listens to music, and sings joyfully whilst she is in the kitchen, and her body language suggests that cooking is a time for her to relax and enjoy life. She works meticulous and confidently preparing the food, and enthusiastically chatters about her forthcoming marriage, and the wedding parties of her friends. These kitchen conversations about discussing menus for celebratory events are a recurring theme throughout the research, and highlight the importance of food, in building social capital and developing common aspirations.

Nibal’s demeanour exhibits a strong sense of self-efficacy. Her physical mannerisms, singing, and lively banter during the creation of the meals, confirms how meaningful food is to her life and how the process of cooking heightens her mood. She is keen to share information about the established cultural rituals surrounding food, and she
explains proudly how the traditional structure of the daily meal times provides stability and a welcoming reassurance to her every day life. The demands of preparing the food for her family are her immediate concern each day, and she relishes this as a special time, in a place where she feels secure in the bosom of her family home, making a worthwhile contribution, that will be appreciated by those people around her.

3.4 Kahoud

Kahoud (22), one of nine children works in his grandfathers established hummus factory in an alleyway in Hebron, and he also manages the adjacent café where he serves the freshly made warm hummus. Kahoud has been greatly influenced by his grandfather, who passed on his culinary skills, and ancient family recipes. Kahoud admits that cooking and preparing the hummus provides him with a dignified and respected status within the local community, and he feels that he belongs to an elite group within the local food industry. He is proud of his achievements, and his acquired skills. The social interaction with other street traders and his customers offer diversification in his life, and this increases his social capital.

The daily routine of making the hummus each morning provides Kahoud with a sense of purpose, and an opportunity to have an element of control over his own destiny. He takes great satisfaction in the knowledge that he is providing a valued service to his customers. The process of preparing the hummus requires intense concentration, and during this time Kahoud is able to forget the troubles or stresses that surround him. Watching him work, fully absorbed in his task in the hot airless, but scrupulously clean small room, he appears to be engrossed in a meditative ritual, only pausing occasionally to signal to his assistant to operate certain machinery, or to issue instructions to stir the mixture again. Whilst observing Kahoud intensely focused on the task of operating the machinery to make the hummus, it is clear that he is experiencing a ‘moment of exception’.

Conversations with Kahoud reveal that he is objective and realistic about the situation in Hebron. He strives to combat external interventions, and his ‘internal locus of control’ enables him to be optimistic about the future.
3.5 The confectioner

Baking pastries and desserts has been a family business of many years and a central part of the confectioner’s life. His rich family history of successful Palestinian baking motivates him to continue the tradition of creating ancient recipes, and he shares his common aspirations with his sons, refining their skills to produce the authentic traditional recipes that are specially made for celebrating religious events. These sweet creations are considered a vital food element, which sustain the Palestinian culture.

The physical status (heightened stature) and mannerisms (laughter and smiles) displayed by the family as they work together in such synchrony, confirm that there is a strong bond and emotional connectedness between them. This positive interdependence, and shared view of a future with the confectionary business is a prime factor in embellishing sumud.

3.6 The Abrahamic Soup Kitchen

The male volunteers, who cook the food for the poorest Hebronites, arrive at the Abrahamic soup kitchen at 4.30am every morning to start preparing the dish of the day. On average they feed approximately 3000 hungry and grateful people one meal per day. This knowledge alone makes them feel valued for their efforts, and they gain an inner sense of satisfaction to know that their actions are making a significant difference to other peoples lives.

On the day of the visit, the four men cook the 500 kilos of chicken that have been purchased from local farms around Hebron, using money that has been generously donated by tourists, the local community, United Arab Emirates, and revenues provided by the waqf.24 Despite the hot and claustrophobic conditions inside the kitchen area, the volunteers work tirelessly and happily together following a highly organised clockwork routine to produce the free meals. There is a great sense of solidarity and positive energy flowing between them as they work.

24 Waqf is the Arabic term for ‘religious endowments or donations’.
The volunteers believe that their work at the Abrahamic soup kitchen is essential in building sumud for the poorest people living in the community. They provide their services for free, as they feel it is their duty to support others less fortunate than themselves. Working in the soup kitchen increases their self-esteem, and creates a strong sense of belonging within the wider community.

Some of the local residents, who received the free food, reveal that they depend on this service not just for the nutritious free meal, but also for the regular opportunity to collectively meet and socialise with other people who are living in a similar situation. When queuing for their food they have time to interact with others, and this provides essential emotional support. The children in particular, look forward to coming to the soup kitchen, as it is a time when they can play freely and safely with their friends.

3.7 The juice seller

This man continues to operate the family business of selling freshly squeezed juice, and cold refreshing drinks from a stall in the walled city, despite the restrictions opposed on him by the Israeli occupation. Working for himself, means that he can take care of his son whilst earning money, and also allows him time to socialise with fellow Hebronites working in the souk. As he cuts the fruit for squeezing, he shares his memories about happier times in the past, when Hebron was surrounded by orange groves. Now, because of the occupation he has to go further afield to fetch his produce, and since the occupation he has noticed a decline in the number of people who come to the souk to purchase his refreshments. He has adapted his stall to meet local demands, and he now sells chilled canned drinks for his customers. However, he prefers the more natural and traditional drinks made with the local fresh ingredients like lemons, tamarinds and apricots that are part of his Arabic culture.

He is concerned about future prospects for his young son, and sometimes he finds it hard to think positively about the future. He knows the only way to help prepare his son for coping with life in Hebron is to build his sumud by instilling a strong work ethic in him, increasing his awareness of the world through education, and by encouraging him to develop positive friendships with a wide network of people.
3.8 The Kharoub seller

The Kharoub seller in Hebron is popular with the street traders in the vegetable and fruit market, and he appreciates when the stallholders offer him fresh items of food in exchange for a cup of his homemade brew. His work provides many opportunities for social interaction, increasing his social capital. He feels valued by his colleagues in the souk and his ritual of making the traditional Kharoub, and dressing up each day provides meaning to his existence.

3.9 The Jaberi Family

The Jaberi family home is located between four Israeli checkpoints, overlooked by armed soldiers in watchtowers, and is one of few remaining Palestinian homes in this area that is now completely surrounded by newly built Israeli settlements. The Jaberi family have lived here since 1998.

Living in the midst of the Kiryat Arba settlement, an area that is known for extreme settler violence, the Jaberi family are regularly exposed to physical and verbal harassment from the neighbouring settlers. This includes seasonal thefts of food produce from their vegetable plot and orchard. Despite these continued threats, physical attacks, and stealing of their crops from their garden, the family continue to lovingly tend their vegetables, and harvest the fruit from their orchards. The family recognise their vulnerabilities, and take positive action to resist, and to protect themselves, and their possessions. For example, they have made physical adaptations to their home to combat these issues, by building high brick walls around their home, and installing video cameras to record such attacks. The organisation, B’Tselem\(^\text{25}\) have provided the family with the video recording equipment in the hope that they are able to collect evidence of any future attacks against them so legal proceedings can be taken. The

\(^{25}\) B’Tselem - The Israeli Information Centre for Human Rights in the Occupied Territories was established in February 1989 by a group of prominent academics, attorneys, journalists and Knesset members. As an Israeli human rights organisation B’Tselem acts primarily to change Israeli policy in the Occupied Territories and ensure that its government, which rules the Occupied Territories, protects the human rights of residents there and complies with its obligations under international law (www.btselem.org, 2014).
family hope that the recorded films can be used to seek justice, and also prevent future harassment. Adapting their lives in this way demonstrates sumud.

It is evident that the family thrive on the support, and unconditional love they have for each other. The ritual of the daily cooking and sharing of food, embellishes their history and heritage, strengthens their bonds and gives them a central focus to their day. The underlying principle of togetherness, and hospitality is a significant feature of their culture and identity. Making the present day their immediate concern is a positive coping strategy that the whole family have embraced.

3.10 A chance encounter with the owner of an abattoir

The abattoir owner has lived in Hebron all of his life, where he has continued running his family business. As a business owner he has more freedom of movement, but his roots are firmly planted in Hebron and Palestinian culture. He discusses at length the political situation in Hebron and he wishes life in Palestine could be different, but sometimes he admits to feeling powerless to make a difference. His sumud is made up of his love for his country, and the immense satisfaction and pleasure he gains from his work in the food industry. Through his meaningful work, which is an integral part of his life, he meets many interesting people, and he has established a large network of friends and contacts. He is disappointed that his own sons do not have the same love of his business, and do not wish to follow in his footsteps. He cannot understand why his sons would spurn the opportunity to continue working in a successfully established profitable family business that would provide them with a more than adequate income. A self-confessed wealthy man, he considers the virtues of being in his position, adding wistfully, ‘but what is the point of having such wealth, if you do not have freedom?’ These thoughts are echoed by Izzeldin Abuelaish, an eminent Palestinian doctor, ‘For any human being, freedom is essential, crucial, to our dignity and our ability to be fully human’ (Abuelaish, 2012:138).
3.11 Um Abdullah

Baking traditional taboon bread for family and friends on her own Taboon\textsuperscript{26} brings Um Abdullah local acclaim, and huge respect from the community. She is highly regarded by her neighbours and people flock to her Taboon each morning to taste her delicious bread. Um Abdullah normally begins to cook the bread around 4am, as it is cooler at this time. She is keen to demonstrate her skills of baking the bread in her Taboon, which is located in the floor of an unassuming, small breezeblock shed behind her home.

Um Abdullah has a positive self-image, and she revels in her popularity as the local taboon bread baker. She gets pleasure continuing the legacy of cooking the traditional taboon bread, and from observing the genuine appreciation of her customers. Her baking skills enable her to maintain regular connections to fellow Palestinians in the area, who share the same history and cultural values, so she feels a sense of belonging.

3.12 The bread bakers in the souk

Bags of Kmaj\textsuperscript{27} are often delivered early in the morning to local homes by young boys keen to earn some pocket money, and orange bags of bread can often been seen hanging on the door handles of homes in Hebron. This bread is baked in the archways of the souk, where a bread baker and his son work tirelessly making vast quantities of kmaj. Although the machinery in the bakery is ancient, it still works perfectly and the bakers keep the kitchen area scrupulously clean. The men work quietly and systematically in tandem, churning out ample quantities of dough balls reading for baking. Baking bread has been this man’s livelihood for many years, and he cannot imagine doing anything else. Although, many of his friends of a similar age have now retired, he enjoys the routine of running the bakery, and is uplifted by the aromas of the newly baked bread. His daily chats to his regular customers increase his social capital.

He takes meticulous care of his ancient machinery, and enjoys the physical repetitive procedures required to operate them. His skilful hand movements have become fluid unconscious actions, and he works in a meditative way, in complete harmony with the

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{26} A Taboon is an ancient clay bread oven, shaped like a cone in the ground with a layer of lime stone pebbles inside. The lid is normally made of clay or metal. \\
\textsuperscript{27} Kmaj is traditional Arabic bread made of wheat and barley similar to pita bread.
\end{footnotesize}
clockwork clanking sounds of the cogs and rollers, and other moving parts of the apparatus. He concentrates diligently on the task of producing the freshest, and highest quality kmaj in Hebron Old City. He is optimistic about the future, and keen to see the occupation end and for peace to prevail. Whatever the future holds, he hopes that he can continue to bake bread for many years to come.

Khubz Saj is different variety of Palestinian bread, which is griddled on a very hot saj on the streets throughout the souk. The bread bakers in Hebron enjoy performing and demonstrating their mastered skills to the customers, tossing the circular cooked breads high into the air before cooking the reverse side on the saj. There is laughter, and friendly competitive remarks between the bakers, as they compete for the highest throw and expertly spin the dough on their fingers. This repartee and humour promotes their emotional wellbeing and signifies how involvement with food can alleviate stress.

With all the bakers, it is evident that the repetitive physical actions, and social interaction are vital elements of promoting positive feelings, and self-esteem. The concentration on their immediate task of baking allows them to experience ‘moments of exception’.

3.13 Um Talal al Hadad

Um Talal al Hadad (52) is currently recovering at home following a serious operation, and treatment for breast cancer. Her eldest daughter, Reham (26) lives close by with her husband, three daughters and young son, and she visits to help nurse her mother, and assist with the cooking. Um Talal al Hadad has another daughter Shada (24), who works in a beauty centre; and also a much younger daughter called Rama (7). The family are her support system and she relies on them during this difficult time.

Her house is situated on the crest of a steep hill in Tel Rumeida overlooked by a heavily guarded watchtower, and even her home has Israeli cameras fixed to the roof. Despite the oppressive atmosphere surrounding them, the restrictions of movement, and the

---

28 A saj is a metallic cast iron dome, a bit like an upturned wok or skillet that is heated to a high temperature over hot coals or a gas burner, and it is used to cook bread or pancakes.
significant presence of IDF in close proximity to their home the family remain resilient and continue to resist feeling persecuted. This ability to have the required strength and emotional capacity to cope with such daunting external influences comes partly from the basic necessity to provide the family with an adequate nutritional diet to survive. Meeting together each day for the family meal is a central focus, and something the whole family is involved in. The husband or daughter will go shopping and carry the food items up the steep hill to the home, and Um Talal al Hadad will cook with the younger members of the family helping as much as they can.

Eating together is an important ritual when the family visibly relax, and share their concerns and hopes for the future. Although, some of their daily struggles are very challenging and upsetting, Um Talal al Hadad’s sense of humour, and her ability to make light of such circumstances, is obviously a successful and positive coping mechanism for her, and her family, and reflects the strength and inner courage that she has, to rise above the situation.

3.14 Abdi el Kareem Hadad

Abdi (54) has worked for most of his life as a shoemaker, but now food is a central theme in his life. He helps his son Talal (20) to run a restaurant selling hummus and chicken, and his younger son Ahmad (18) assists in the kitchen of the restaurant. Another brother Diaa, (21), also works in the food industry as a baker in Jerusalem.

Abdi explains that it is the location of his home in Tel Rumeida and the restrictions of access that are the most challenging obstacles to their life. When his wife was taken ill and collapsed, he called the ambulance, but the drivers of the ambulance took a very long time to negotiate access through the checkpoint. When they finally managed to persuade the IDF to allow them to pass, the ambulance drivers parked the vehicle at the bottom of hill, and then had the difficult and onerous task of carrying a barely conscious patient down the very steep incline on a stretcher over the most difficult terrain. This took them a long time and was a precarious operation. In 2009, Matteo Benatti, the head of the ICRC sub-delegation in Hebron admitted that the ICRC often have to intervene on humanitarian grounds, as ‘ambulances taking Palestinian residents to hospital in emergencies can face long delays at checkpoints’ (ICRC, 2009:1).
Abdi has lived in Hebron for fourteen years. Between 2000 and 2007, Israeli soldiers invaded his home, and took over occupation of the house for use as a temporary military base. For over two years, the family were restricted to one room within the house, and were only allowed out of the room to use the bathroom, or to go out shopping for food. No friends were allowed to visit the house, and a curfew was set at 5pm, so sometimes when Abdi returned home late from work he was refused entry to his own home.

The courage, and resilience of Abdi and his family is exceptional, and very humbling. Considering the difficult situations that they have had to face, there is no sign of bitterness or rage, and no cry for sympathy, just an immense capacity for forgiveness, and a desire for lasting peace, and a better existence. He explains that the preparing and sharing of food is one of the most stabilising events in their life. A necessary event, yes, but also a time when they can socialise, celebrate their musical talents, laugh together, and briefly forget the occupation.

3.15 The ‘Women in Hebron’ Cooperative

Nawal Sleimah the founder of the non-profit handicrafts cooperative ‘Women in Hebron’ invited nine of the women in the cooperative to cook a traditional *Maftoul* at the headquarters of the organisation in the small village of Idnah on the outskirts of Hebron. The group of nine traditionally dressed women were keen to share their stories and demonstrate their cooking techniques. Fahera, one of the women, explained proudly that they were going to use a very old recipe that had been passed down through generations, and heated discussions took place about the exact origin of the recipe.

Listening to these conversations it was apparent that ownership of the actual recipe used was of vital importance to them. Esma, the matriarch of the group, who provided a large antique cooper circular bowl that belonged to her grandmother, was elected head cook for the day. The women gladly followed Esma’s instructions, smiling as they began the long process of lighting gas burners, cleaning pots and pans, cutting up chicken and chopping vegetables.

---

29 *Maftoul* is an ancient Palestinian dish of steamed wheat or semolina with meat stew.
Albert Bandura believes that people have the power to shape their life circumstances. He discusses how human agency at individual and collective levels can influence self-efficacy; ‘People create social systems and these systems, in turn, organise and influence people’s lives (Bandura, 2006:164). This was apparent when observing the group of women working together. There was a unity of purpose, a sense of calm, and inner satisfaction as the women worked cohesively towards a common goal of creating the Maftoul.

Many psychologists recognise that physical activity becomes an outlet for releasing tension and anxiety, and therefore facilitates emotional stability and building resilience, and Csikszentmihalyi (1975) suggests that when a person is immersed in an activity that is simultaneously challenging, invigorating and meaningful they can experience a joyful state called flow, which diminishes self-consciousness and promotes positive feelings. This was evident when observing the women engaged in intense physical activity. The repetitive actions, and rhythmic arm movements required when massaging the flour, couscous, and liquid together in large bowls seemed to almost put the women into a meditative state.

Throughout the four-hour process of preparing the Maftoul the women converse freely and share their memories and plans for the future. Many of the women in the group have suffered hardship and losses, and they give emotional support to each other by listening and offering friendship. One lady involved in the cooking, was particularly sad about the recent death of her husband, however, she was comforted and supported by the other women in the group. She was very quiet and withdrawn at the beginning of the session, but she was encouraged to engage in the cooking process, and by the end of the day, it was noticeable how her spirits were lifted. She was smiling and interacting with her fellow cooks.

Subjects in the conversations alternated quickly from talk about recent deaths in the village, to friendly arguments about who was the best cook, to more excited plans on how they were going to prepare for a local wedding. This constant lively narrative was interspersed with regular mundane authoritative instructions from Esma, explaining when to light the gas, and when to begin cook the vegetables.
The collective sense of pride in their joint accomplishment of the creation of the Maftoul was obvious from their smiles and relaxed body language (Fig. 14).

*Fig. 14. The ‘Women of Hebron’, relaxed and content after cooking.*
Chapter 4

Conclusions and reflections

The ability to think positively and to have a sense of hope is an important ingredient of resilience (Bandura, 2006), and this was observed amongst the participants. A famous quotation of Napoleon Hill (1883-1970) came to mind during this research: ‘Every adversity, every failure, every heartache, carries with it the seed on an equal or greater benefit’ (Hill, 2014) and it suggests the notion, that those who have struggled most, will often have higher resilience and a greater capacity to deal with future challenges. This remains debateable, but does seem to echo the findings in this study.

Windle (1999:163) describes resilience as ‘the successful adaptation to life tasks in the face of social disadvantage or highly adverse conditions’, and if this is a broadly accepted definition of the ability to withstand shocks and stresses, and to be able to persist in an uncertain world, then this would aptly define the resilience that was observed. As Piccolo describes in ‘The Anatomy of Resilience in Palestine (Piccolo, 2014:1), ‘despite all that is marshalled to crush their spirits, they somehow overcome the tragedies and indignities, and continue to live their lives’.

Bonanno (2004:1) challenges the common held belief that many adults who are exposed to loss and potentially traumatic events in their lives are rarely able to continue to have positive emotional experiences in the future. He also believes that ‘resilience in the face of loss or potential trauma is more common than often believed and that there are multiple and sometimes unexpected pathways to resilience’. Evidence from this research demonstrates how food can be one of those pathways.

The findings of this study have exposed that food can provide opportunities for supporting coping strategies, and there is no doubt that food is recognised as a significant positive event in the lives of the Palestinians who were interviewed. As well as providing the fundamental balanced diet, and necessary nourishment to support healthy physical development, stamina, and good mental health, the buying, preparing and sharing of food, also provides them with many opportunities for social interaction, helping them to forge new friendships.
Informal conversation around food provides a platform for sharing concerns, and space to engage in more therapeutic discussions. New memories are created, and people feel they are a significant part of the celebratory events, and culture. Reminders of past events, family and religious traditions are evoked through food, and this enhances a sense of belonging. It was observed that some of most meaningful exchanges occurred when families came together to share a meal. Food was considered the glue that holds celebratory events together and helps to sustain the Palestinian culture.

The preparation and presentation of the food was found to give the majority of the participants increased self-esteem, a satisfying sense of accomplishment, and a sense of pride in their achievements. When the cooking of the food was participatory and collaborative, there seemed to be an even greater sense of collective inner satisfaction.

Research has proved that physical activity combats negative emotions (Salmon, 2001). The physical exertion of preparing the cuisine is therapy in itself, and the kneading of dough for example, and the mixing and stirring skills require repetitive movements that are calming to the mind, and as The Edge Partnership (2012:5) report ‘repetitive exercise can be a chance for the mind to switch off’. Observations in Hebron highlighted how the physical work of preparing food creates a calming effect on participants. The high presence of the five main characteristics of resilience (Wagnild and Young, 1993), the habitual routine, and rituals of creating daily meals offers a sense of purpose, and a formal structure to the day, making life more meaningful.

Visiting these communities in Hebron, demonstrates how food supports common aspirations, and increases a stronger sense of self-efficacy. The practising of newly acquired cooking skills, and the sharing of recipes from different families, and past generations, provides a sense of belonging, a historical perspective, and shared interests. In addition, it was evident that food increases social capital, and this in turn develops resourcefulness and contributes to resilience.

There were many ‘moments of exception’ when participants experienced a heightened joyful state, called flow (Csikszentmihalyi, 1975), when they were immersed in deep concentration, and the laughter, singing and joyful banter seemed to obliterate any negative thoughts for a brief period of time. Celebrating their achievements, having a
shared sense of humour, and being able to laugh about life’s difficulties and personal challenges is a significant and beneficial factor in building sumud.

Overall, this work in Hebron, has demonstrated that food can be one of the integral elements that will help to build and enhance resilience, and sumud in the face of adversity. The Edge Partnership (2012:4) report ‘being able to talk and be listened to strengthens resilience’ and it is hoped that all the participants who took part in this research also benefitted emotionally by taking part, telling their stories, and contributing to the study.

The findings from narratives provided in this study has highlighted how food merits further research on how it can:

1. Be a useful tool in reinforcing and maintaining culture and traditions.
2. Provide opportunities for strengthening ties, developing emotional resilience and sumud.
3. Increase opportunities for conflict transformation.

It is hoped that the publication of the resulting cookbook will highlight these aspects, and increase awareness of how Palestinians living in Hebron develop strategies, and find ways to adapt and remain positive despite living in such difficult circumstances.

This concluding poem by Mahmoud Darwish (2010) sums up the collective resilience and tenacity of the Palestinian people who contributed to this research. Thank you again to all the inspiring and humble people in Hebron who shared their stories. Your hospitality, courage, optimism, strength, warmth, generosity and sumud will never be forgotten.

*Here on the slopes of hills,*  
*Facing the dusk and the cannon of time,*  
*Close to the gardens of broken shadows,*  
*We do what prisoners do,*  
*And what the jobless do,*  
*We cultivate hope.*
## APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Statement of Ethics Review Approval and an example of a consent form</td>
<td>57-59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Copy of flat plan that was used to create layout of cookbook</td>
<td>60-62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 1.

Statement of Ethics Review Approval

Faculty of Technology, Design and Environment

Ethics Review Form E1

This form should be completed by the Principal Investigator / Supervisor / Student undertaking a research project which involves human participation. The form will identify whether a more detailed E2 form needs to be submitted to the Faculty Research Ethics Officer.

Before completing this form, please refer to the University Code of Practice for the Ethical Standards for Research Involving Human Participants, available at [http://www.brookes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/](http://www.brookes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/) and to any guidelines provided by relevant academic or professional associations.

It is the Principal Investigator / Supervisor who is responsible for exercising appropriate professional judgement in this review. Note that all necessary forms should be fully completed and signed before fieldwork commences.

Project Title: *Recipes for Resilience – Celebrating Palestinian culture and the sumud of Palestinians living in Israel.*

Principal Investigator / Supervisor: **Beatrice PiQUARD**

Student Investigator: **Melissa Stockdale**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1. Does the study involve participants who are unable to give informed consent? (e.g. children, people with learning disabilities, unconscious patients)</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. If the study will involve participants who are unable to give informed consent (e.g. children under the age of 16, people with learning disabilities), will you be unable to obtain permission from their parents or guardians (as appropriate)?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Will the study require the cooperation of a gatekeeper for initial access to groups or individuals to be recruited? (e.g. students, members of a self-help group, employees of a company, residents of a nursing home)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Are there any problems with the participants' right to remain anonymous, or to have the information they give not identifiable as theirs?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Will it be necessary for the participants to take part in the study without their knowledge/consent at the time? (e.g. covert observation of people in non-public places?)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Will the study involve discussion of or responses to questions the participants might find sensitive? (e.g. own drug use, own traumatic experiences)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Are drugs, placebos or other substances (e.g. food substances, vitamins) to be administered to the study participants?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Will blood or tissue samples be obtained from participants?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Is pain or more than mild discomfort likely to result from the study?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Could the study induce psychological stress or anxiety?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Will the study involve prolonged or repetitive testing of participants?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Will financial inducements (other than reasonable expenses and compensation for time) be offered to participants?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Will deception of participants be necessary during the study?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Will the study involve NHS patients, staff, carers or premises?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If you have answered 'no' to all the above questions, send the completed form to your Module Leader and keep the original in case you need to submit it with your work.

If you have answered 'yes' to any of the above questions, you should complete the Form E2 available at [http://www.brockes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/Ethics-review-forms/](http://www.brockes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/Ethics-review-forms/) and, together with this E1 Form, email it to the Faculty Research Ethics Officer, whose name can be found at [http://www.brockes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/Research-ethics-officers/](http://www.brockes.ac.uk/Research/Research-ethics/Research-ethics-officers/).

If you answered 'yes' to any of questions 1-13 and 'yes' to question 14, an application must be submitted to the appropriate NHS research ethics committee.

Signed: [Signature]  
Principal Investigator  
/Supervisor

Signed: [Signature]  
Student Investigator

Date: 12.05.19
Example of a CONSENT FORM

Title of Project:
Recipes for Resilience: Celebrating Palestinian cuisine and the sumud of Palestinians living in the occupied territory of Hebron.

Name, position and Oxford Brookes contact address of Researcher:
Melissa Stockdale
A student studying at Oxford Brookes University, on MA course at the Centre for Development of Emergency Practice, Headington Campus, Oxford. OX3 OBP, UK. Email: 13102708@brookes.ac.uk

Please initial box

1. I confirm that I have read and understand the information sheet for the above study and have had the opportunity to ask questions.

2. I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without giving reason.

3. I agree to take part in the above study.

Please tick box

4. I agree to the interview / focus group / consultation being photographed

5. I agree to the photographs being published in the cookbook and dissertation

6. I agree to the use of anonymised quotes in publications and my name to be used in the publication of the cookbook and dissertation

______________________________  __________________________  __________________________
Name of Participant                  Date                        Signature

______________________________  __________________________  __________________________
Name of Researcher                  Date                        Signature
BIBLIOGRAPHY


El-Haddad, L., (2013) (@ GazaMom) @4noura@the IMEU we categorically reject notion of ‘hummus kumbaua’ – breaking bread can never foster coexistence [sic] if inequities go unaddressed, March 27 2013, 10.52am tweet.


